Music's Intellectual History: Founders, Followers & Fads

The first conference of the Répertoire International de Littérature Musicale

New York City
16–19 March 2005

http://www.rilm.org
THURSDAY, 17 MARCH 2005

Harold M. Proshansky Auditorium
Biography then and now
Michael Saffle

8:30-10:30

Conference Room C.203–C.204
8:30-10:30

Intersections of musicology and ethnomusicology
Philippe Vendrix

Cleveland Johnson (DePauw University), The first “All-India” music conferences and the advent of modern Indian musicology

Pauline Girard (Bibliothèque nationale de France), Léo Delibes par Henri de Curzon: Un stéréotype de biographie de musicien en France au début du 20e siècle?

Daniel G. Geldenhuys (University of South Africa, Pretoria), Enlightening a continent: The legacy of a music history in Africa

Benjamin Walton (University of Bristol), Rossini’s bust: The twin styles and the demands of Romantic biography

Martin Lodge (University of Waikato, Hamilton), A broad drama without detail: The strange case of nonexistent music history writing in New Zealand

James Deaville (McMaster University, Hamilton, Ontario), Fictional biography as music history: Elise Polko’s Musikalische Märchen

James Melo (Répertoire International de Littérature Musicale, New York), Macinaina out of the woods: The meanders of musicology and ethnomusicology in Brazil

Break

11:00-12:30

Harold M. Proshansky Auditorium
11:00-12:30

Vivaldi and Handel
Ruth DeFord

Conference Room C.203–C.204

Bella Brover-Lubovsky (School of Music, University of Illinois), Estro armonico: “Harmony” and the paradox of historical recognition

Juan José Pastor Comín (Universidad de Castilla-La Mancha), Musical transmission of Garcilaso de la Vega’s poems in Cervantes’ texts

Ilias Chrissochoidis (Stanford University), Handel’s reception and the rise of music historicography

Andreas Vejvar (Universität Mozarteum, Salzburg), Constructing music history in a novel: Alejo Carpentier’s conception of “threnody”

David Hunter (The University of Texas at Austin), Writing a nation’s musical taste: Hawkins, Burney and the popularization of Handel in the first histories of music

David L. Mosley (Belharmonie University, Louisville), The advantages and disadvantages of music for life: Composing an untimely history of music
the passage from the modal system to tonality (Saggio sulla melodia popolare, 1889). A similar methodological impulse appears in the article "Una canzone popolare del Cinquecento'Male per me tanta belè mirar" (Rivista musicale italiana, 1915), which analyses three different stages of a popular song: a simple three-voices "napolitana" (G. Zappasorgo), a more complicated polyphonic piece for five voices (G. Ferretti), a monody which follows the tonal criteria (J.-B. Besard).

Anna Harwell Celenza (Michigan State University, East Lansing), Using Hans Christian Andersen as a window on music history.

Hans Christian Andersen was the most prominent Danish author of the 19th century. Now known primarily for his fairy tales, during his lifetime he was equally famous for his novels, travelogues, poetry, and stage works, and it was through these genres that he most often reflected on the world around him. With the arrival of the bicentennial of Andersen’s birth (2005), there is much about the writer that is not yet common knowledge. This paper explores a single aspect of that void — his interest in and relationship to the music culture of 19th-century Europe.

Why look to Andersen for information about music? To begin, Andersen had a musical background. He enjoyed a brief career as an opera singer and dancer at the Royal Theater in Copenhagen, and in later years he went on to produce opera libretti for the Danish and German stage. Andersen was also an avid music devotee. He made thirty major European tours during his seventy years, and on each of these trips he regularly attended opera and concert performances, recording his impressions in a series of travel diaries. In short, Andersen was a well-informed listener, and as this paper reveals, his reflections on the music of his age serve as valuable sources for the study of music reception in the 19th century.

Over the course of his life, Andersen embraced and then later rejected performers such as Maria Malibran, Franz Liszt, and Ole Bull, and his interest in opera and instrumental music underwent a series of dramatic transformations. In his final years, Andersen promoted figures as disparate as Wagner and Mendelssohn, while strongly objecting to Brahms. Although such changes in taste might be interpreted as indiscriminate by modern-day readers, such shifts in opinion were not contradictory, but rather quite logical given the social and cultural climate of the age.

Ilias Chrissochoidis (Stanford University), Handel’s reception and the rise of music historiography.

Georg Friedrich Handel was the first composer to receive extensive and continuous historiographical attention. The earliest accounts of his life appear in John Mainwaring’s Memoirs of the life of the late George Frederic Handel (1760), John Hawkins’ A general history of the science and practice of music (1776), and Charles Burney’s An account of the musical performances — in commemoration of Handel (1785).

Turning things around, these inaugural specimens of music historiography in Britain were specifically written to celebrate Handel’s life and achievements. Mainwaring’s biography was a commemorative volume, which also served the publicity needs of the Covent Garden opera company after the composer’s death. Hawkins’s History mounted a conscious defense of a music tradition whose culmination was Handel. And the Account of Burney presented a sanitized view of the 1784 Handel Festival as the musical apotheosis of the century.

Handel thus was more than the subject of these narratives; he was a motivating factor for the rise of British music historiography. The present paper examines his posthumous image as recorded and manipulated in these early historical accounts. My aim is twofold: to probe them as instruments of Handel’s canonization; and to examine their positioning of Handel’s life as an archetype of trial and triumph reflecting aspects of British identity. To give an example, Handel’s dissociation from Italian opera evokes the dissociation of England from the grasp of Rome centuries earlier. The emergence of music historiography can be seen, therefore, as part of Handel’s reception in 18th-century Britain.

Nicholas Cook (Royal Holloway University of London), Changing the subject: Writing, texts, recordings.

The influence of philology in the context of the 19th-century creation of national traditions resulted in a conception of music as written text, and an intimate relationship between music and word, that has characterized musicology ever since (and perhaps music too, in traditions that range from late 19th-century 'narrative' music to 20th-century 'campus' composition). Broad cultural developments associated with poststructuralism and postmodernism placed a new emphasis on reception, in other words on performed rather than inherent meaning, but the reflection of these developments in the 'new' musicology of the 1990s was curiously skewed: largely as a result of its embrace of Adorno, it retained the traditional conception of music as written text. The contrast between Adorno and post-Adornian sociologies of meaning can stand for the distinction between a musicology centred on written texts (whether understood in terms of national spirit, great men, or autonomous works of art) and one that takes seriously the idea of music as a performing art, and so takes as its primary subject the study of performances and their reception. That of course entails the study of recordings, which are at the same time specifically musical 'texts' (commodities at the intersection of music and material culture) and historical documents as subject to critical interpretation as any other. Just as writing about music impacts upon performance style (as illustrated for instance by the changing image of Webern), so performance style impacts upon writing about music, bringing about the prospect of a 'history of music' predicated not on compositional innovation but on performance and reception — on music, in short, as experienced in everyday life.

Timothy J. Cooley (University of California, Santa Barbara), How 19th-century musical folklore created Poland’s Górale diaspora in 20th-century Chicago.

After nearly half a century of economic migration from Poland’s Tatra Mountain region to the urban prairie of Chicago, Górale (Polish highlander) immigrants organized as a distinct ethnic group in the 1920s. The move was at once regional, national, and global as the diaspora community coalesced around music-cultural performances integral to producing and maintaining a sense of group identity that had only recently been codified. Performing identity with distinctive music/sonic practices, dance, clothing styles, and linguistic cues, a few well-documented musicians were instrumental in linking groups in Chicago, New York, and Toronto with villages in southern Poland commonly described as "isolated". The result is a complex negotiation of "separateness" and "connection" across and within numerous social, political and ideological fronts.

This paper considers the historical and intellectual structures required in the formation of a diasporic social identity in a nation-state of immigrants. Why would a group of men and women from Poland living in Chicago choose to recognize themselves as a village group rather than align with the larger Polish immigrant community in that city? What sort of ideological infrastructure was necessary to make such an identification both possible and desirable? I suggest that part of this infrastructure was provided by musical folklore in Poland from the last half of the 19th century up through the 1920s by showing how the creation of a musically articulated identity was integral in creating the ethnicity "Górale" in the first place.